Individual Work Product

Dr. Andrea Hutchison| Content Advisor to the Texas State Board of Education

As this revision process comes to a close, I want to thank everyone who served on the Work Groups and everyone who submitted public comment or testimony throughout the past year. I have read your comments and listened closely to your testimony, and the perspectives shared by Texas educators, parents, and community members have shaped my recommendations at every stage of this work.

I support the consensus recommendations produced by the Content Advisors across most of the courses I reviewed, U.S. History, World History, Government, and Personal Financial Literacy. World Geography is the exception; I was not able to support the consensus recommendation for that course, as I do not believe it reflects the discipline of geography with the depth and rigor it deserves, and I am instead advocating for the version presented after the first reading. The amendments in this individual recommendation capture where I depart from the Content Advisor Consensus Recommendation across all reviewed courses.

Throughout my review, two concerns recurred across courses and grade levels frequently enough to warrant the Board's attention. First, several standards still embed a conclusion rather than defining a scope of learning for students to reach on their own, most often through characterizations presented as settled fact rather than content for students to examine. Second, several standards misalign verb and content, most often using "describe" when "explain" is called for. "Describe" asks students to state features or details (e.g., a region's geographic features), while "explain" asks students to account for why or how something happened (e.g., why a region's geography shaped its historical development). I have recommended amendments throughout to correct both patterns, so that standards define what students study rather than predetermine what they conclude, and each verb matches the rigor the course is meant to deliver. I have also recommended amendments addressing scope, since several standards asked students to master more content than a single course, or in some cases a single semester, can reasonably support.

It has been an honor to serve as a Content Advisor throughout this K-12 Social Studies TEKS Revision process. I am grateful to my fellow content advisors and to TEA staff for their partnership, and I am confident that, with continued attention to these issues, these standards can reflect the rigor and clarity Texas students and teachers deserve.

A complete list of my suggested revisions for each course listed in the Content Advisor Consensus Recommendation can be found on the following pages of this document.

Sincerely,

Andrea Hutchison

World Geography

I was not able to support the proposed World Geography course as presented in the Content Advisors' consensus document. My objection centers on a course that, as written, does not reflect the discipline of geography with the depth and rigor it deserves. Geography is the study of place, space, and the human and physical systems that shape how people live, interact, and make decisions across the world, not a collection of disconnected facts about locations. A strong geography course should equip students to think critically about spatial relationships, human-environment interaction, and global interconnection, and to apply those concepts to their own lives and future careers, whether in business, public policy, environmental science, or any field shaped by an increasingly interconnected world.

I advocate instead for the version of the course presented after the first reading, which better reflects that vision of geography as a rigorous, analytical discipline. I have included suggested amendments to the consensus version of the document as well, which I believe will substantially strengthen it and bring it closer to the standard the first reading version set:

Current Language	Proposed Amendment	Rationale
~~1D develop and use mental maps to understand relative location, spatial patterns, processes, and relationships at various scales (Geo/C, S); and~~	1D develop and use mental maps to understand relative location, spatial patterns, processes, and relationships at various scales (Geo/C, S); and	Restore. Mental mapping is a foundational geographic reasoning skill, students building internal spatial representations to understand relative location and patterns at different scales (local, regional, global), rather than only working from provided maps. It's a core disciplinary practice geography courses are built to teach, not a niche or supplementary item, so this standard belongs.
~~2B use the demographic transition model, population pyramids, and dependency ratios to predict future population trends of different societies (Geo/C, S);~~	2B use the demographic transition model, population pyramids, and dependency ratios to predict future population trends of different societies (Geo/C, S);	Restore. These are core analytical tools of population geography, students use them to interpret real demographic data and forecast trends, giving them a concrete, quantitative skill set for understanding how and why societies change over time.
(2D) analyze the relationship between access to reliable and affordable energy, including fossil fuels and	2D ~~analyze the relationship between access to reliable and affordable energy, including fossil fuels and intermittent, renewable energy sources to~~	Restore to the original and add in GDP per capita and life expectancy

intermittent, renewable energy sources to ~~compare levels of development and standard of living in a variety of places using~~ Gross Domestic Product (GDP), ~~and~~ literacy rates, life expectancy, and other indicators of human flourishing (Geo/C, S);	compare levels of development and standard of living in a variety of places using Gross Domestic Product (GDP), GDP per capita, and literacy rates, and life expectancy	
~~(2E) define and describe the components of culture, including identity, language, faith-based systems, shared practices, material goods (Geo/C);~~	**(2E) define and describe the components of culture, including identity, language, faith-based systems, shared practices, material goods (Geo/C);**	Restore. Culture's components, identity, language, belief systems, shared practices, and material goods, are foundational vocabulary for human geography, giving students the framework to examine cultural variation across regions throughout the rest of the course.
~~(2G) compare government systems along the political spectrum between limited and unlimited systems, including democracy, dictatorship, monarchy, republic, theocracy, authoritarian, and totalitarian (G/Civ);~~	**(2G) compare government systems along the political spectrum between limited and unlimited systems, including democracy, dictatorship, monarchy, republic, theocracy, authoritarian, and totalitarian (G/Civ);**	Restore. Comparing government systems along a limited-to-unlimited spectrum is core political geography content, giving students a framework to understand how governance varies across regions and connects to broader patterns in human geography.
~~2H describe how Earth–Sun relationships and elevation impact the spatial distribution of climates or biomes (Geo/C); and~~	2H explain how elevation, latitude, wind systems, ocean currents, position on a continent, and mountain barriers influence temperature, precipitation, and distribution of climate regions;	The original standard limited climate and biome distribution to two factors, Earth-Sun relationships and elevation, leaving out other major controls like ocean currents and continentality. The revised standard reflects the fuller set of factors geographers use to explain climate and restructures the outcome so students explain effects on temperature and precipitation first, then apply that to climate

		distribution, better mirroring how climate concepts build in instruction.
3A describe how Earth–Sun relationships impact weather conditions, including tornadoes and hurricanes (Geo/C); and	3A describe how Earth–Sun relationships impact weather conditions, including tornadoes in Tornado Alley and hurricanes along the Gulf and Atlantic coasts (Geo/C); and	Increased specificity
~~(5A) analyze the benefits and consequences of human-environment interactions, including commercial agriculture and use of natural resources~~ explain the benefits of human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in the United States and Texas including the Hoover Dam, air conditioning, and the Clean Air Act (Geo/C, G/Civ, E).	(5A) analyze the benefits and consequences of human-environment interactions, including commercial agriculture and use of natural resources ~~explain the benefits of human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in the United States and Texas~~ including the Hoover Dam, air conditioning, and the Clean Air Act (Geo/C, G/Civ, E).	Restore to the original, but keep specific examples.
(5B) explain how places plan for, mitigate, and respond to natural ~~hazards~~ events using seawalls, including the Galveston seawall (H, G/Civ, E); and	5B explain how places plan for, mitigate, and respond to natural hazards ~~using seawalls~~, including the Galveston seawall (H, G/Civ, E); and	Removing "using seawalls" keeps the Galveston reference as a concrete example while opening the standard to other hazard mitigation strategies, giving it room for fuller content without losing the Texas-specific reference. Keep the term “hazards”. "Hazards" is the precise disciplinary term in geography for naturally occurring phenomena with the potential to cause harm
5C (C) explain how places plan for, mitigate, and respond to natural ~~hazards~~ events using the National Weather Service (H, G/Civ, E).	5C explain how places plan for, mitigate, and respond to natural hazards ~~events~~ using the National Weather Service (H, G/Civ, E).	"Hazards" is the precise disciplinary term in geography for naturally occurring phenomena with the potential to cause harm
7A explain cultural convergence including shared Enlightenment	(7A) explain cultural convergence ~~including shared Enlightenment~~	Restore. The original is grounded in the actual geographic mechanisms, migration, trade, innovation, and

ideals and the development of the United States and Texas as a melting pot ~~and caused by migration, trade, innovations, and diffusion~~ (Geo/C, E); and	~~ideals and the development of the United States and Texas as a melting pot and~~ caused by migration, trade, innovations, and diffusion (Geo/C, E); and	diffusion, that explain convergence anywhere in the world.
[~~(8B) explain the advantages and disadvantages of participation by sovereign states in international organizations, including the United Nations and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) (G/Civ); and~~]	8B explain the role and purpose of the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) (Geo/C, G/Civ)	Restores NATO but takes up less instructional time
(8C) memorize and locate on maps the fifty United States, Austin, the capital of Texas, and Washington, DC, the capital of the United States (Geo/C, G/Civ).	~~(8C) memorize and locate on maps the fifty United States, Austin, the capital of Texas, and Washington, DC, the capital of the United States (Geo/C, G/Civ).~~	"Memorize and locate" is a rote recall task, well below the analytical and comparative demand expected elsewhere in the course. This would be better placed in the elementary grades.
9B ~~analyze the benefits and consequences of human-environment interactions, including commercial agriculture, deforestation, tourism, [and] the use of natural resources , and the construction of~~ explain the benefits of human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in Latin America and the Caribbean, including chinampas, Incan terrace farming, rainforest conservation, and **the Panama Canal** (Geo/C, E); and	9B analyze the benefits and consequences of human-environment interactions, including commercial agriculture, deforestation, tourism, the use of natural resources , and the construction of ~~explain the benefits of human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in Latin America and the Caribbean, including chinampas, Incan terrace farming, rainforest conservation, and~~ **the Panama Canal** (Geo/C, E); and	Restore. The new standard framed human-environment interaction only in terms of "benefits" and "ingenuity," presenting adaptation as uniformly positive without room to examine its costs. This amendment restores the original, raising the verb to "analyze" and reframes it around "benefits and consequences".
(9C) describe how places in Latin America and the Caribbean plan for, mitigate, and respond to natural	(9C describe how places in Latin America and the Caribbean plan for, mitigate, and respond to	Restore to hazards.

~~hazards~~ events, including flooding and earthquakes (H, G/Civ, E).	natural hazards ~~events,~~ including flooding and earthquakes (H, G/Civ, E).	
~~10B describe how physical features, including mountains and rainforests, influence the size and distribution of settlements in Latin America (G/Civ, Geo/C)~~	10B describe how physical features, including mountains and rainforests, influence the size and distribution of settlements in Latin America (G/Civ, Geo/C)	Restore. Allows students to have a contemporary example.
10B explain how the Incan Road system and chinampas influenced patterns of human settlement in Latin America and the Caribbean (H, Geo/C); and	~~10B explain how the Incan Road system and chinampas influenced patterns of human settlement in Latin America and the Caribbean (H, Geo/C); and~~	Streamline to focus on more contemporary examples, like the one above.
11B compare how political power is distributed in various countries, including Mexico, Cuba, and the United States (G/Civ).	11B compare how political power is distributed in various countries, including Mexico, Cuba, ~~and~~ relative to the United States (G/Civ).	The United States isn't a Latin American or Caribbean country, so listing it alongside Mexico and Cuba misstates the region. Reframing it as a comparison point keeps the pedagogical value while fixing the scope mismatch.
12C explain cultural divergence within communities in Latin America, including the Nahuatl, Quechua, and Mayan (H, Geo/C)	12C explain cultural divergence within communities in Latin America, including the ~~Nahuatl~~, Nahua, Quechua, and Maya~~n~~ (H, Geo/C)	"Nahuatl" and "Mayan" are language names, not the names of the peoples themselves, creating an inconsistent mix of language and ethnic terminology within the same list.
13C ~~analyze the benefits and consequences of human-environment interactions associated with agriculture, deforestation, and commercial mining~~ explain the benefits of human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in Africa, including qanats, irrigation systems, terrace farming, and wildlife conservation (Geo/C, G/Civ, E); and	13C analyze the benefits and consequences of human-environment interactions associated with agriculture, deforestation, and commercial mining ~~explain the benefits of human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in Africa, including qanats, irrigation systems, terrace farming, and wildlife conservation~~ (Geo/C, G/Civ, E); and	Restore. See similar examples above in 5A and 9B.

(13D) describe how places plan for, mitigate, and respond to natural ~~hazards~~ events, including flooding and drought (H, G/Civ, E).	(13D) describe how places plan for, mitigate, and respond to natural hazards ~~events~~, including flooding and drought (H, G/Civ, E).	Keep hazards.
16B explain the cultural divergence ~~caused~~ were influenced by ~~colonial borders~~ the Berlin Conference in Sub-Saharan Africa (H, Geo/C); and	16B explain the cultural divergence caused ~~were influenced~~ by colonial borders ~~the Berlin Conference~~ in Sub-Saharan Africa (H, Geo/C); and	Restore. Keeping "colonial borders" and removing "the Berlin Conference" broadens the standard from one specific 1884-85 event to the fuller, ongoing process of colonial border-drawing, which more accurately explains the region's cultural divergence than a single diplomatic conference alone.
17C ~~analyze the benefits and consequences of human-environment interactions in Southwest Asia or North Africa, including urban development, water management, and oil extraction~~ explain the benefits of human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in Southwest Asia and the Middle East, including qanats, irrigation systems, desalination, terrace farming, and oasis agriculture (Geo/C, G/Civ, E).	17C analyze the benefits and consequences of human-environment interactions in Southwest Asia or North Africa, including urban development, water management, and oil extraction ~~explain the benefits of human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in Southwest Asia and the Middle East, including qanats, irrigation systems, desalination, terrace farming, and oasis agriculture~~ (Geo/C, G/Civ, E).	. Restore. See similar examples above in 5A and 9B.
20B explain the cultural divergence ~~caused~~ were influenced by trade, including religion (H, Geo/C); ~~and~~	20B explain ~~the~~ cultural divergence in Southwest Asia and North Africa caused ~~were influenced~~ by trade, including religion (H, Geo/C)	Clarity
21C describe how places in Central or South Asia plan for, mitigate, and respond to natural ~~hazards~~ events, including earthquakes and monsoons	21C describe how places in Central or South Asia plan for, mitigate, and respond to natural hazards ~~events.~~ including	Change events to hazards. See similar examples above in 5A and 9B.

and explain human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in including terrace farming, stepwells, cyclone shelters, and mangrove restoration (Geo/C, G/Civ, E)	earthquakes and monsoons and ~~explain human ingenuity in adapting to the environment~~ analyze the benefits and consequences of human-environment interactions including terrace farming, stepwells, cyclone shelters, and mangrove restoration (Geo/C, G/Civ, E)	
25C (C) ~~describe how places in Southeast Asia or Oceania plan for, mitigate, and respond to natural hazards, including mangrove restoration and artificial reefs~~ explain human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in Oceania, including Aboriginal fire management, rainwater collection, and coral reef conservation (Geo/C, G/Civ, E).	25C (C) describe how places in Southeast Asia or Oceania plan for, mitigate, and respond to natural hazards, including mangrove restoration and artificial reefs ~~explain human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in Oceania, including Aboriginal fire management, rainwater collection, and coral reef conservation~~ (Geo/C, G/Civ, E).	See similar examples above in 5A and 9B.
(28B) explain the cultural divergence in Southeast Asia or Oceania ~~caused~~ were influenced by geographic isolation ~~and colonial influence~~ (H, Geo/C); and	(28B) explain ~~the~~ cultural divergence in Southeast Asia or Oceania caused ~~were influenced~~ by geographic isolation and colonial influence (H, Geo/C); and	Colonial influence is a major, well-documented driver of cultural divergence in Southeast Asia and Oceania, distinct European, French, British, Dutch, Spanish, and American colonial administrations imposed different languages, religions, legal systems, and borders across the region, producing lasting cultural differences between neighboring areas that geographic isolation alone doesn't explain.
30D) ~~describe the development of family planning policies in East Asia (G/Civ, E)~~ explain how China's one-child policy used government	(30D) describe the development of family planning policies in East Asia (G/Civ, E) ~~explain how China's one-child policy used government authority to restrict~~	The original standard named a single, no-longer-active Chinese policy as its entire content, prescribing a specific conclusion for students to explain rather than examine. The revision broadens it to

authority to restrict family size and affected birth rates (G/Civ, Geo/C):	~~family size and affected birth rates (G/Civ, Geo/C).~~	family planning policies across East Asia generally, allowing comparison across countries and current policy landscapes rather than one outdated, country-specific case.
33B ~~analyze the benefits or consequences of human-environment interactions in case studies, including hydroelectric power, permafrost adaptation, the Aral Sea crisis, and the Chernobyl Nuclear Disaster (H, Geo/C)~~ explain human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in Russia and the Republics, including permafrost engineering and the Trans-Siberian Railroad, nuclear containment following the Chernobyl Nuclear Disaster and Aral Sea restoration (H, Geo/C, E) .	(33B) analyze the benefits or consequences of human-environment interactions in case studies, including hydroelectric power, permafrost adaptation, the Aral Sea crisis, and the Chernobyl Nuclear Disaster (H, Geo/C) ~~explain human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in Russia and the Republics, including permafrost engineering and the Trans-Siberian Railroad, nuclear containment following the Chernobyl Nuclear Disaster and Aral Sea restoration (H, Geo/C, E).~~	Restore. See similar examples above in 5A and 9B.
37B ~~analyze the benefits and consequences of human-environment interactions in case studies, including commercial agriculture, the polder system, hydroelectric dams, and acid rain~~ explain human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in Europe, including the polder system and river restoration (E, Geo/C)~~.~~ and	37B analyze the benefits and consequences of human-environment interactions in case studies, including commercial agriculture, the polder system, hydroelectric dams, and acid rain ~~explain human ingenuity in adapting to the environment in Europe, including the polder system and river restoration~~ (E, Geo/C)~~.~~ and	Restore. See similar examples above in 5A and 9B.
(38C) analyze push or pull forces that affect human migration patterns in Europe, including the high cost of	(38C) analyze push or pull forces that affect human migration patterns in Europe, including the	High speed rail is a great modern example that students can connect with.

urban living, ~~the availability of high-speed rail transportation,~~ and economic opportunities (G/Civ, E).	high cost of urban living, the availability of high-speed rail transportation, and economic opportunities (G/Civ, E).	
~~39B explain the advantages and disadvantages of the participation by European sovereign states in the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) and the European Union (G/Civ).~~	39B explain the role and purpose of the European Union (EU) in the political geography of Europe (G/Civ).	Partially restores the content to focus on the European Union but takes up less instructional time.

World History

I support the Content Advisors' consensus document for World History, as I agree with, or have no objection to, most of the changes proposed. That said, I am including a number of amendments to the original document.

The most significant of these concern language throughout the course that characterizes Islam and Islamic history in a manner inconsistent with the neutral, descriptive standard applied to other religious and cultural traditions covered in the course. My amendments also address a broader pattern worth correcting: the course's coverage leans heavily toward Western civilization, leaving several non-Western cultures and civilizations underrepresented relative to their historical significance. Additionally, several standards pair verbs with a cognitive demand that doesn't match their content, and my amendments bring these into alignment with the analytical rigor expected throughout the course. Taken together, these amendments bring the course's content and framing in line with the same standards of consistency, neutrality, and comprehensiveness applied throughout this revision.

Proposed Standard:	Suggested Amendment:	Rationale
1A describe how development of agriculture during the Neolithic Revolution led to ~~the development of agriculture,~~ permanent settlements, ~~and the growth of early civilizations~~ (H, Geo/C, E);	1A ~~describe~~ explain how ~~development of agriculture during~~ the Neolithic Revolution led to the development of agriculture, permanent settlements, and the growth of early civilizations (H, Geo/C, E);	Clarity, restores the growth of early civilizations.
1B compare major characteristics of River Valley civilizations in	1B compare major characteristics of River Valley civilizations in	China's Yellow River civilization is one of the four classic river valley civilizations

Mesopotamia, Egypt, and Indus Valley, including settlement patterns and farming (Geo/C); and	Mesopotamia, Egypt, ~~and~~ the Indus Valley, and China, including settlement patterns and farming (Geo/C); and	typically taught alongside Mesopotamia, Egypt, and the Indus Valley. Without it, students receive an incomplete comparison of the major early river valley civilizations, missing one of the most significant examples.
(4D) describe how the Roman Empire led to the Jewish Diaspora, including the destruction of Jerusalem, the destruction of the Second Temple, and the forced migration and scattering of Jewish communities across the Mediterranean region (H, Geo/C);	(4D) ~~describe~~ explain how the Roman Empire led to the Jewish Diaspora, including the destruction of Jerusalem, the destruction of the Second Temple, and the forced migration and scattering of Jewish communities across the Mediterranean region (H, Geo/C);	Better verb alignment.
4F analyze the probable causes for the fall of the Roman Empire, including rampant inflation and moral decay (H, G/Civ, Geo/C).	4F analyze the probable causes for the fall of the Roman Empire, including political stability, economic decline, overextension of the empire,~~rampant inflation and~~ moral decay, and invasions by Germanic tribes (H, G/Civ, Geo/C).	The original standard listed only "rampant inflation and moral decay" as causes, overlooking major factors historians typically cite for Rome's fall. Adding political instability, economic decline, overextension of the empire, and invasions gives students a fuller, more evidence-based picture of the empire's decline alongside the existing causes.
8D explain early Islam in terms of the Prophet Mohammed's brutal military campaigns against Jewish and Christian tribes, the normalization of slavery, and the taking of female captives as harem slaves (Geo/C);	~~8D explain early Islam in terms of the Prophet Mohammed's brutal military campaigns against Jewish and Christian tribes, the normalization of slavery, and the taking of female captives as harem slaves (Geo/C);~~ 8D explain the origins and early spread of Islam, including the teachings of the Prophet Mohammed, the military campaigns of early Islamic expansion, and the role of conquest in the growth of the early Islamic empire (Geo/C);	The current standard uses characterizations that don't hold up to close historical scrutiny, "harem slaves" applies a later Ottoman-era institutional term to a very different 7th century context, and "brutal" is a subjective label rather than a factual description. Standards should describe what happened using precise, source-grounded language, not terms that overstate or mischaracterize the historical record. Revising the standard to focus on the documented facts of Islam's origins and expansion keeps the content accurate and defensible.
8E describe the teachings of jihad and how these teachings led to the expansion of Islam and the conquest of Christian lands (H,	~~describe the teachings of jihad and how these teachings led to the expansion of Islam and the conquest of Christian lands (H,~~	Increased accuracy.

G/Civ, Geo/C, E);	~~G/Civ, Geo/C, E);~~ describe the concept of jihad and its role in the expansion of Islam, including military conquest and the spread of Islamic rule into Christian territories (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E);	
	NEW 8H explain the contributions of the Islamic Golden Age to mathematics, medicine, astronomy, and the preservation and transmission of Greek and Roman texts to Western civilization (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E);	This document already includes standards on the intellectual contributions of Greece, Rome, and the Byzantine Empire, several of which credit those civilizations with preserving classical knowledge that shaped the West. The Islamic Golden Age played a documented role in that same transmission, preserving and translating Greek and Roman texts that later reached Western Europe through Latin translation, work Western scholars themselves relied on during the Renaissance.
8F explain the practice of slavery, the origin of the word "slave" from Viking enslavement of the Slavs, and the enslavement and slave trade carried out by Viking and Muslim raiders (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E); and	8F explain the practice of slavery, ~~the origin of the word "slave" from Viking enslavement of the Slavs,~~ and the enslavement and slave trade carried out by Viking and Muslim raiders (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E); and	The word origin is an interesting linguistic detail, but it's not substantive historical content compared to the practice of slavery and the Viking and Muslim raiding and trading this standard needs to cover. Removing it streamlines the standard without losing meaningful historical understanding.
10B describe the effects of the Black Death and the medieval military revolution (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E, S);	10B ~~describe~~ explain the effects of the Black Death and the medieval military revolution (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E, S);	"Describe" asks students to identify and summarize the effects, while "explain" asks them to reason through the causal relationship, why the Black Death and the medieval military revolution produced the effects they did.
(11) Faith, Empires, and Medieval Transformations. The student understands Indian and Chinese civilizations from 1000-1700. The student is expected to:	(11) Faith, Empires, and Medieval Transformations. The student understands Indian ~~and~~ Chinese, and Sub-Saharan African civilizations from 1000-1700. The student is expected to:	Includes African civilizations

	NEW 11D describe key aspects of Sub-Saharan African history, including the wealth and trade networks of the Mali Empire under Mansa Musa, the trans-Saharan gold and salt trade, and the rise of the Songhai Empire (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E).	This section already covers India and China's major medieval civilizations, and Sub-Saharan Africa's empires during this same period, most notably Mali under Mansa Musa and the rise of Songhai, fit naturally alongside them in scope and significance. These empires built substantial wealth through trans-Saharan trade in gold and salt and are well documented in the historical record. Including this standard rounds out the course's coverage of major world civilizations during the medieval period and gives students a fuller global picture consistent with how the rest of this section is structured.
12C explain that the Renaissance focused on the value of the individual and that this core characteristic influenced American founders' ideas about rights and government (H, G/Civ, Geo/C);	explain ~~that the~~ how Renaissance humanism's focus ~~focused~~ on the value of the individual ~~and that this core characteristic~~ influenced American founders' ideas about rights and government (H, G/Civ, Geo/C);	"The value of the individual" describes humanism without naming it, leaving out the specific term for the intellectual movement that historians credit with this shift in thinking. Naming "Renaissance humanism" directly gives students the vocabulary and historical grounding to connect this idea to the founders' thinking, rather than an unnamed paraphrase.
12E describe how the conflict between Protestant and Catholics weakened the influence of the Catholic church, including The ~~Great Peasants' War,~~ The French Wars of Religion, and the Thirty Years War (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E, S); and	12E ~~describe~~ explain how the conflict between Protestant and Catholics weakened the influence of the Catholic church, including The The French Wars of Religion, and the Thirty Years War (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E, S); and	Better verb alignment
13B explain key philosophies of the Enlightenment, including primacy of reason over superstition and natural rights, and describe the influence of the Enlightenment on American political thoughts (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E).	13B ~~explain~~ describe key philosophies of the Enlightenment, including primacy of reason over superstition and natural rights, and ~~describe~~ explain the influence of the Enlightenment on American political thoughts (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E).	Better verb alignment

14A describe how European monarchs strengthened national governments by increasing royal power, collecting taxes, creating national armies, and unifying kingdoms, including England, France, and Spain (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E);	14A ~~describe~~ explain how European monarchs strengthened national governments by increasing royal power, collecting taxes, creating national armies, and unifying kingdoms, including England, France, and Spain (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E);	Better verb alignment
15B analyze the effect of geography on Pre-Columbian civilizations , including agriculture and settlement patterns (H, Geo/C, E, S).	15B analyze the effect of geography on Pre-Columbian civilizations , including Aztec agriculture in the valley of Mexico, Incan agricultural terracing in the Andes, and Taíno settlement patterns in the Caribbean (H, Geo/C, E, S).	Increased specificity
16D describe how slavery emerged and expanded as a global institution through warfare, raids, and regional slave trading networks in Africa, the Mediterranean world, and the Americas, including the role of the Barbary slave trade and the Atlantic slave trade (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E);	16D ~~describe~~ explain how slavery emerged and expanded as a global institution through warfare, raids, and regional slave trading networks in Africa, the Mediterranean world, and the Americas, including the role of the Barbary slave trade and the Atlantic slave trade (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E);	Better verb alignment
18A explain the development of the Industrial Revolution, including factories, new energy sources, urbanization , and the growth of the United States as a melting pot in which people from diverse backgrounds contributed to a shared American society (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E);	18A explain the development of the Industrial Revolution, including factories, new energy sources, and urbanization ~~, and the growth of the United States as a melting pot in which people from diverse backgrounds contributed to a shared American society~~ (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E);	This clause addresses United States immigration and identity, content that belongs in a U.S. History course rather than this World History standard on the Industrial Revolution. Its inclusion here is thematically disconnected from the standard's actual content, factories, energy sources, and urbanization, and removing it keeps the standard focused on the global industrial developments it's meant to cover.
(19A) describe how Enlightenment ideas led to political changes in 19th century England, including suffrage reform and John Locke's ideas about	(19A) ~~describe~~ explain how Enlightenment ideas led to political changes in 19th century England, including suffrage reform and John Locke's ideas about	Better verb alignment

democratization (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, S);	democratization (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, S);	
19D explain the causes, including the need to modernize due to military weakness and economic backwardness compared to Western Europe, and consequences, including serf emancipation in 1861 and the growth of revolutionary movements, of Russia's partially successful 19th century reforms (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E); and	19D explain the causes, including the need to modernize due to military weakness and economic backwardness compared to Western Europe, and consequences, including serf emancipation in 1861 and the growth of revolutionary movements, of Russia's ~~partially successful~~ 19th century reforms (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E); and	"Partially successful" is an evaluative judgment embedded directly in the stem, prejudging the outcome rather than letting students weigh the causes and consequences listed and reach their own conclusion.
22E describe how ~~fascism, Nazism, and~~ communism used propaganda, public shaming, censorship, and forced conformity to maintain control (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E, S).	22E ~~describe~~ explain how communism used propaganda, public shaming, censorship, and forced conformity to maintain control (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E, S).	Better verb alignment
23B explain how the conflict in China between Nationalists and the Chinese Communist Party ~~and consequences of the conflict , including~~ led to the establishment of communism under Mao (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E).	23B explain how the conflict in China between Nationalists and the Chinese Communist Party led to the establishment of communism under Mao Zedong (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E).	Add last name
24C define the Holocaust as the systemic, bureaucratic, state-sponsored persecution and murder of six million Jews by the Nazi regime and its collaborators (H, G/Civ, Geo/C);	24C define the Holocaust as the systemic, bureaucratic, state-sponsored persecution and murder of six million Jews and millions from other targeted groups by the Nazi regime and its collaborators (H, G/Civ, Geo/C);	The current definition names only Jewish victims, omitting the millions of others targeted by the Nazi regime's persecution.
	NEW 27E explain the causes and consequences of the Arab Spring, including the role of social media in the protests, the overthrow of authoritarian governments in Tunisia and Egypt, the Syrian Civil War, and the resulting rise of instability that contributed to the growth of ISIS (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, E).	This section addresses the rise of radical Islam and ISIS but omits the Arab Spring, the wave of protests and uprisings that destabilized several Middle Eastern and North African governments and directly contributed to the power vacuums and civil conflict, particularly in Syria, that allowed ISIS to grow. Adding this standard gives students the causal

		context needed to understand how regional instability led to the extremism already covered later in the section, rather than presenting ISIS's rise without its immediate historical background.

US History

I support the consensus recommendation of the Content Advisors for the U.S. History course. That said, I am advocating for a significant number of amendments throughout the course. Several standards throughout the document embed conclusions or characterizations that would benefit from more neutral framing. These changes are aimed at removing embedded conclusions, correcting verb-content misalignment, and aligning standards to the historical thinking skills in the course introduction. I believe social studies education should teach students how to think critically about history rather than what to conclude about it, equipping them with the analytical skills to examine evidence and reach their own informed judgments. Taken together, these amendments are meant to bring the course's language and structure in line with that principle, while preserving the full scope of historical content the course is meant to teach. See my proposed amendments for the course below:

Proposed Standard:	**Suggested Amendment:**	**Rationale**
3C explain the significance ~~[origins, meanings, and effects]~~ of ~~the Declaration of Independence, including~~ the preamble, statement of natural rights, assertion of the purpose of government to protect individual rights, colonial grievances against Britain and remedies, ~~the idea that all people have rights and governments' power is limited to protect those rights~~ and the assertion of independence and commitment to the cause in the Declaration of Independence (G/Civ);	Replace with 3C analyze the Declaration of Independence, including the author's purpose, audience, historical situation, and point of view, and by contextualizing it within the broader circumstances of its creation (H, G/Civ, S)	Simplified language and aligned to historical thinking skills in the introduction
3F explain that slavery existed in many societies throughout history, including, at the	~~3F explain that slavery existed in many societies throughout history, including, at the~~	Streamling. This standard compresses a broad global

time of colonization, among some Indigenous peoples in America, in Africa, the Middle East, and Southeast Asia, and earlier, in ancient civilizations, and identify colonial opposition to the practice of slavery, including the Quakers (H, G/Civ).	~~time of colonization, among some Indigenous peoples in America, in Africa, the Middle East, and Southeast Asia, and earlier, in ancient civilizations, and identify colonial opposition to the practice of slavery, including the Quakers (H, G/Civ).~~	comparison, slavery across multiple continents and eras, into a single U.S. history standard, where the priority should be a thorough treatment of slavery's development and abolition within the American context specifically. Removing it redirects that space toward deeper coverage of slavery in U.S. history rather than a compressed global survey better suited to a world history course.
(3H) explain reasons for the American victory against British tyranny in the American Revolution, including the geographic advantage of fighting on their own land, foreign allied intervention, other British war obligations, the belief in Divine Providence, and rallying Americans around the idea of freedom (H, G/Civ, E); and	(3H) explain reasons for the American victory ~~against British tyranny~~ in the American Revolution, including ~~the~~ geographic advantages ~~of fighting on their own land,~~ , guerilla warfare and irregular warfare tactics, foreign allied intervention, ~~other~~ competing British war obligations, ~~the belief in Divine Providence,~~ the role of religious belief in sustaining morale, and ~~rallying~~ the mobilization of Americans around the idea of freedom (H, G/Civ, E);	The original standard treats belief in Divine Providence as a factual cause of American victory, which conflates students' historical understanding of the Revolution with a theological claim about why God acted as He did, a claim outside what a history standard can verify or teach as fact. The revision instead has students examine the documented historical role that religious belief played in sustaining morale and motivating the American cause, which preserves the standard's respect for how central faith was to the founding generation while keeping the standard's claims within what history, as a discipline, can actually establish. It also adds guerrilla and irregular warfare tactics as a well-documented factor missing from the original list.
4C analyze how the Constitutional Convention established America as a constitutional republic, including the role of James Madison, The Great Compromise, rights of individuals and states, and three-fifths compromise (G/Civ, S);	4C analyze the Constitutional Convention, including the role of James Madison, The Great Compromise, rights of individuals and states, and three-fifths compromise (G/Civ, S);	Revert to original. The idea of America as a constitutional republic is already in the introduction.
5B describe key developments that strengthened the new nation, including Washington's Farewell Address, Marbury v. Madison, the Louisiana Purchase, the Barbary Wars, the	5B describe key developments ~~that strengthened~~ in the new nation, including Washington's Farewell Address, Marbury v. Madison, the Louisiana Purchase, the Barbary Wars, the	Revert to original. Framing the Missouri Compromise as a development that "strengthened the new nation" overstates its historical significance. It resolved an immediate sectional crisis over the balance of free and slave states

Prohibition on the Importation of Slaves, the Missouri Compromise, and the Monroe Doctrine (H, G/Civ, Geo/C); and	Prohibition on the Importation of Slaves, the Missouri Compromise, and the Monroe Doctrine (H, G/Civ, Geo/C); and	admitted to the Union, but most historians treat it as a temporary measure that deferred the underlying conflict over slavery's expansion rather than resolving it, one that arguably deepened sectional division and set a precedent for the compromises that ultimately failed to prevent the Civil War.
6B describe Jacksonian Democracy as a political movement that expanded voting rights by eliminating property requirements and emphasized the power of the common man (H, G/Civ);	6B describe Jacksonian Democracy as a political movement that expanded ~~voting rights~~ suffrage by eliminating property requirements and emphasized the power of the common man (H, G/Civ);	This is an opportunity to introduce students to "suffrage," the disciplinary term historians use for the right to vote, rather than relying on the more general everyday phrase "voting rights."
	NEW 6D analyze the concept of Manifest Destiny and its role in shaping U.S. territorial expansion, including its influence on westward migration, annexation policy, and relations with Native Americans and Mexico (H, G/Civ, Geo/C)	A standard on Manifest Destiny fills a gap in covering the ideology that drove westward expansion, annexation, and conflict with Mexico and Indigenous nations.
6G describe the early women's suffrage movement, including the 1848 Seneca Falls Convention, and identify key leaders, including Susan B. Anthony and Elizabeth Cady Stanton (H, G/Civ); and	6G describe the early women's suffrage movement, including the 1848 Seneca Falls Convention, and identify key leaders, including Sojourner Truth, Susan B. Anthony and Elizabeth Cady Stanton (H, G/Civ); and	Adding Sojourner Truth strengthens the standard's leadership list. She was a prominent voice in the early suffrage movement whose perspective as a formerly enslaved Black woman brought a distinct dimension to the movement's arguments that the standard's original leaders alone didn't capture.
8B explain the main causes of sectionalism leading to the Civil War, including the expansion of slavery, the Fugitive Slave Act in the Compromise of 1850, disagreements over states' rights, and tariffs (G/Civ, Geo/C, E, S).	8B explain slavery as the central cause ~~the main causes~~ of sectionalism ~~leading to~~ and the Civil War, including ~~the~~ its expansion into new territories ~~of slavery~~, the Fugitive Slave Act in the Compromise of 1850, and its role in disputes ~~disagreements~~ over states' rights, and tariffs (G/Civ, Geo/C, E, S).	The original standard lists slavery as one of four coequal causes of the Civil War, alongside states' rights and tariffs, when historical scholarship establishes slavery as the central cause that the other disputes were substantially bound up with. The revision restructures the standard so slavery organizes the other factors rather than sitting alongside them as an equal and separate item.
8C identify key developments	8C identify key developments	Restores original and adds election of

which strengthened sectional tensions over slavery ~~leading to the Civil War,~~ including Uncle Tom's Cabin, Kansas Nebraska Act, Dred Scott v. Sanford (1857), ~~Lincoln-Douglas Debates (1858)~~, and John Brown's raid (H, G/Civ, Geo/C); and	which ~~strengthened sectional tensions over slavery~~ leading to the Civil War, including Uncle Tom's Cabin, Kansas Nebraska Act, Dred Scott v. Sanford (1857), Lincoln-Douglas Debates (1858), ~~and~~ John Brown's raid, and the election of Abraham Lincoln (1860) (H, G/Civ, Geo/C); and	Lincoln
8D identify arguments for and against expanding slavery based on the principle of popular sovereignty from excerpts of the First Lincoln Douglass Debate (H, G/Civ); and	~~8D identify arguments for and against expanding slavery based on the principle of popular sovereignty from excerpts of the First Lincoln Douglass Debate (H, G/Civ); and~~	See above suggestion to add back in Lincoln-Douglas Debates. *If this standard is kept, "Douglass" should be corrected to Douglas as this is referring to Stephen Douglas, not Frederick Douglass.
9D explain how Ulysses S Grant viewed service to the United States including excerpts from Chapter I "Personal Memories of U. S. Grant" (H, G/Civ).	~~9D explain how Ulysses S Grant viewed service to the United States including excerpts from Chapter I "Personal Memories of U. S. Grant" (H, G/Civ).~~	Streamlining. This standard's scope is too narrow for a U.S. history course, resting on one individual's self-account in a single memoir chapter rather than a broader historical development or theme.
9C explain the advantages and disadvantages of both sides during the Civil War, including ~~manufacturing, population~~, resources, ~~raw materials,~~ and military expertise (Geo/C, E);	Replace with analyze the military, economic, geographic, and political advantages and disadvantages of the Union and the Confederacy at the outset of the Civil War, including the Union's Anaconda Plan (H, G/Civ, E, Geo/C)	Higher level verb and includes geographic and political advantages and disadvantages as well as the Anaconda Plan
9E identify Galveston as the location of the Juneteenth announcement (H, Geo/C).	~~9E identify Galveston as the location of the Juneteenth announcement (H, Geo/C).~~	Juneteenth is already covered in earlier grades, and this standard limits students to identifying only the location of the announcement rather than deepening their understanding of its significance. Removing it eliminates unnecessary repetition without losing meaningful content.
11H describe key advancements for African Americans the status	Replace with:	The original standard combined civil rights, economic achievement, and the

of civil rights in American society after the Civil War, including Booker T. Washington, the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP), Black Wall Street, and Madame CJ Walker, and describe the Great Migration (G/Civ, E).	11H describe the status of civil rights in American society after the Civil War, including Jim Crow Laws and Plessy v. Ferguson (1896), and the responses of Booker T. Washington, W.E.B Du Bois, and the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP), (H, G/Civ). 11I 11I describe the causes and effects of the Great Migration (G/Civ, E, Geo/C) 11J describe Black economic advancement in this era, including Madame C.J. Walker and the rise of Black Wall Street (H, E)	Great Migration into one overloaded item, and inaccurately grouped Booker T. Washington as an "civil rights advancement". The revision splits these into three standards: 11H frames Washington, Du Bois, and the NAACP as distinct responses to Jim Crow and Plessy v. Ferguson, 11I isolates the Great Migration on its own, and 11J separates Black economic advancement from civil rights content entirely.
(12) ~~Imperialism and~~ World War I. The student understands the Age of Expansion and World War I contributing to America becoming a world power. The student is expected to:	(12) Imperialism and World War I. The student understands the Age of Expansion and World War I contributing to America becoming a world power. The student is expected to:	Restore. "Imperialism" is the disciplinary term for a nation extending power over other territories, naming the pattern behind U.S. actions like the annexation of Hawaii, the Spanish-American War, and the Philippines annexation, none of which are part of World War I itself. Removing the term folds this distinct expansionist policy under a section titled only "World War I," leaving students without a name for content the section actually covers.
13A describe how American society changed in the Roaring Twenties, including prohibition, the 19th Amendment , the Harlem Renaissance, the emergence of consumer culture influenced by radio and movies, the Tulsa Race Riots eugenics, and the Red Scare (H, G/Civ, Geo/C);	Replace with: 13A analyze change and continuity in American society between 1918 and 1929, including Prohibition, the 19th Amendment, the Harlem Renaissance, the emergence of consumer culture influenced by radio and film, eugenics, and the Red Scare (H, G/Civ, Geo/C)	Connects to the historical thinking skill of change and continuity
~~13D identify challenges of African Americans between 1914 and 1939, including the Ku Klux Klan, lynchings, and the Tulsa~~	13D describe challenges of African Americans between 1914 and 1939, including the Ku Klux Klan, lynchings, and the Tulsa	Restore and change verb from identify to describe.

~~Race Riots (H, Geo/C, E);~~	Race Riots (H, Geo/C, E);	
14F describe changes to the American homefront made to during World War II, including manufacturing, labor migrations, rationing, the Manhattan Project, the Women Airforce Service Pilots (WASP), Rosie the Riveter, the Bracero Program, and Japanese internment (H, Geo/C, E);	Replace with 14F describe the mobilization of the American homefront during World War II, including wartime industry, labor and demographic shifts such as the Bracero Program, rationing and civilian sacrifice, and scientific and military innovation (H, Geo/C, E) 14G analyze the internment of Japanese Americans during World War II, including Executive Order 9066, its constitutional implications, and lasting effects (H, G/Civ)	The original standard grouped Japanese American internment with home front mobilization efforts like manufacturing and rationing, treating a rights violation as if it were the same. The revision splits these into two standards, one covering mobilization with condensed categories that still name specific examples like the Bracero Program, and a separate standard on internment anchored in Executive Order 9066, giving the topic room for its own constitutional analysis.
14J identify the year 1948 as the date of the establishment of modern Israel, the ancestral homeland of the Jews	~~14J identify the year 1948 as the date of the establishment of modern Israel, the ancestral homeland of the Jews~~	Streamlining. This standard covers a world history event, the founding of Israel, without connecting it to any U.S. decision, policy, or action. It belongs in a world history course, not a US History one.
14L explain President Truman's decision to drop the atomic bomb, including the goals of bringing a rapid end to the war and reducing additional casualties as described in "Statement by the President Announcing the Use of the A-Bomb at Hiroshima" (H, G/Civ).	Replace with: 14L evaluate the decision to drop the atomic bombs on Hiroshima and Nagasaki, including the goals of bringing a rapid end to the war and reducing additional casualties, and the resulting human and political consequences (H, G/Civ)	The atomic bomb decision remains one of the most debated decisions of the 20th century, yet the standard only presents the justifications for the bombing without asking students to weigh it as the contested historical question it remains. Changing "explain" to "evaluate" and naming Hiroshima and Nagasaki directly, along with their human and political consequences, pushes students to assess competing evidence rather than simply accept the stated rationale as settled fact.
(15D) explain how the United States used containment to limit the spread of communism during the Cold War, including the Korean War, Cuban Missile Crisis, the Vietnam War , and in the	Replace with: 15D explain how the United States used containment to limit the spread of communism during the Cold War, including the Korean	The original standard combined general Cold War containment policy with events specific to Kennedy's presidency, the Cuban Missile Crisis and Space Race, into one item. The revision separates these: 15D keeps containment focused on

Space Race (H, G/Civ, Geo/C);	War and the Vietnam War (H, G/Civ, Geo/C) NEW 15E analyze the presidency of John F. Kennedy, including the Bay of Pigs invasion, the Cuban Missile Crisis, the Space Race, and his assassination's impact on the nation (H, G/Civ)	Korea and Vietnam, while 15E gives Kennedy's presidency its own standard with room for those events' full significance.
15E explain domestic anticommunism movements, including the role of Billy Graham, and the use of “under God” as a way to highlight America’s moral and spiritual foundations distinguishing the United States from atheistic communist governments (H, G/Civ, Geo/C)	15E explain domestic anticommunism movements, including the role of Billy Graham, and the use of "under God" as a way to highlight America's moral and spiritual foundations distinguishing the United States from atheistic communist governments, the House Un-American Activities Committee (HUAC) and McCarthyism (G/Civ);	Adding HUAC and McCarthyism gives students a fuller picture of domestic anticommunism, including the congressional hearings, blacklisting, and Red Scare tactics that defined the era alongside its religious and cultural expressions.
15G explain how the 14 th Amendment was used in Abington School District vs Schempp to apply First Amendment protections to public school and school prayer (H, G/Civ);	~~15G explain how the 14 th Amendment was used in Abington School District vs Schempp to apply First Amendment protections to public school and school prayer (H, G/Civ);~~	This standard's focus on a single case's application of 14th Amendment incorporation is overly specific for a U.S. history course with a packed scope of content to cover, and it fits more naturally in a government or civics course, where constitutional law and case analysis receive the sustained, dedicated treatment this topic warrants.
15H identify the significance of key civil rights leaders including Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr., Thurgood Marshall, Texan Barbara Jordan, and Hector P. Garcia (H, G/Civ);	15H identify the significance of key civil rights leaders including Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr., Thurgood Marshall, ~~Texan~~ Barbara Jordan, and Hector P. Garcia (H, G/Civ);	It reads as if “Texan” is her first name.
15K identify the negative effects of the counterculture movement of the 1960s through the 1970s, including changing attitudes toward marriage, changes in rates of	~~15K identify the negative effects of the counterculture movement of the 1960s through the 1970s, including changing attitudes toward marriage, changes in rates of divorce, and the difference~~	The standard directs students toward a predetermined conclusion, evaluating only the "negative effects" of the counterculture movement, rather than allowing students to examine the movement's effects broadly and draw

divorce, and the difference between the rate of poverty in married households and divorced households (G/Civ, Geo/C, E); and	~~between the rate of poverty in married households and divorced households (G/Civ, Geo/C, E); and~~	their own conclusions. This one-sided framing doesn't reflect sound historical inquiry, and the content itself (marriage and divorce rates, poverty comparisons by household type) is more sociological data than a historical analysis of the counterculture movement's causes, goals, and impact.
15N describe arguments about the negative effects from the development of the modern welfare state that emerged from continued expansion of Great Society programs (H, G/Civ, E).	~~15N describe arguments about the negative effects from the development of the modern welfare state that emerged from continued expansion of Great Society programs (H, G/Civ, E).~~	This standard asks students to describe arguments for one predetermined conclusion, that the welfare state has had negative effects, rather than examining Great Society programs' effects from multiple perspectives, embedding a one-sided judgment into the standard itself.

Government

I support the consensus recommendation of the Content Advisors for the government course. The proposed changes are an improvement over the current standards, well organized, and rigorous. That said, my experience as an educator leads me to believe students should be taught how to think critically, not what to think, which matters especially in a course meant to prepare students to become informed citizens ready to participate in our constitutional republic. Furthermore, this course is typically taken by seniors who are on the cusp of adulthood and becoming eligible to vote, and they deserve a government course that is relevant to their lives and prepares them for that responsibility. Therefore, while I believe that foundational documents and ideas remain an essential part of any government course, I also believe students need more exposure to modern elections and political participation than the proposed course currently provides in order to become informed voters. In alignment with these beliefs, I am proposing the following amendments to the consensus recommendation:

Proposed Standard:	Suggested Amendment:	Rationale
1A: contrast the role of citizens in different forms of government, including a republic, democracy, oligarchy, monarchy, theocracy, and dictatorship, and explain Aristotle's distinction between governments that serve the common good and those that serve private interests in Book III of Politics (H,	1A contrast the role of citizens in different forms of government, including a republic (representative democracy), direct democracy, oligarchy, monarchy, theocracy, and dictatorship, and ~~explain Aristotle's distinction between governments that serve the common good and those that serve private~~	A representative government is a type of democracy, so contrasting the two could be difficult. Republic and democracy overlap rather than sit opposite each other. Listing them as two types of democracies is a better option. Is Aristotle's Book III of Politics, democracy is listed as deviant form (serving private interests). Framing

G/Civ).	~~interests in Book III of Politics~~ (H, G/Civ).	democracy as a form that "serves private interests" risks teaching students it's a flawed system of government, which isn't a message a standard should send when representative democracy is the foundation the rest of the course is built on.
1C describe the role of religion in relation to America's core ideals, including civic virtue, limited government, rule of law, and preservation of liberty, and recite and explain John Adam's statement "Our Constitution was made only for a moral and religious people. It is wholly inadequate to the government of any other" (H, G/Civ); and	~~1C describe the role of religion in relation to America's core ideals, including civic virtue, limited government, rule of law, and preservation of liberty, and recite and explain John Adam's statement "Our Constitution was made only for a moral and religious people. It is wholly inadequate to the government of any other" (H, G/Civ); and~~ 1C analyze the relationship between religious belief and civic virtue in early American political thought (H, G/Civ, Geo/C)	The original standard requires students to recite and accept a single Founder's claim as fact, while the revision has them analyze the broader relationship between religious belief and civic virtue, preserving the content but replacing memorization of one perspective with analytical engagement. *Note: If this standard is kept, "John Adam's" should be changed to John Adams'*
1D explain Washington;s emphasis on civic virtue, national unity, and patriotism using excerpts from Washington;s Farewell Address (1796) (H, G/Civ, S);	~~1D explain Washington;s emphasis on civic virtue, national unity, and patriotism using excerpts from Washington;s Farewell Address (1796) (H, G/Civ, S);~~ 1D Analyze Washington's Farewell Address (1796) by examining the author's purpose, audience, and message (H, G/Civ, S)	The original standard tells students what themes to find in the Farewell Address before they read it, while the revision has them analyze the document's purpose, audience, and message directly, raising the cognitive demand and letting students arrive at Washington's ideas through their own reading rather than supplied conclusions.
3B identify natural rights in the Declaration of Independence, including "the laws of nature and of nature's God"(G/Civ); and	~~3B identify natural rights in the Declaration of Independence, including "the laws of nature and of nature's God"(G/Civ); and~~ 3B identify unalienable rights named in the Declaration of Independence, including life, liberty, and the pursuit of	The Declaration's text names "unalienable Rights," not "natural rights," and separately invokes "the laws of nature and of nature's God" as the source of authority for asserting them, a distinct concept that is instead listed as an example of a right.

	happiness, and explain the appeal to 'the laws of nature and of nature's God' as the source of authority for asserting them (G/Civ)	
	3A (new) read the full text of the Declaration of Independence as a founding document of the United States (H, G/Civ);	To comply with TEC 28.002
	4A (new) **(A)** read the full text of the United States Constitution as a founding document of the United States (H, G/Civ);	To comply with TEC 28.002
(4A) explain that the legitimate purpose of government is to secure natural rights and that just government derives its authority from the consent of the governed;	~~(4A) explain that the legitimate purpose of government is to secure natural rights and that just government derives its authority from the consent of the governed;~~ 4A analyze how the Declaration of Independence's assertion that governments derive "their just powers from the consent of the governed" establishes the legitimate purpose of government as securing natural rights (H, G/Civ);	The original "explain that" construction states the conclusion for students to restate, while the revision has them analyze the Declaration's actual language to arrive at the same idea, raising cognitive demand and grounding the standard in a primary source rather than a supplied fact.
4D explain the importance of families, religious institutions, voluntary associations, and community organizations in promoting civic virtue, self-government, and the preservation of liberty (G/Civ);	4D analyze Tocqueville's argument that ~~explain the importance of~~ families, religious institutions, and voluntary associations~~, and community organizations in promoting civic virtue, self-government, and the preservation of liberty~~ serve as mediating institutions that cultivate civic virtue and sustain self-government, using excerpts from Democracy in America (G/Civ, S)	Aligns to TEC 28.002 The original standard asserts these institutions' importance as a given conclusion with no named source, while the revision attributes the claim to Tocqueville and has students analyze his actual argument from Democracy in America excerpts, raising cognitive demand and grounding the standard in primary source text.
recite the Preamble to the United States Constitution and explain its	~~Explain the purpose and meaning of the Preamble to the United~~	Streamlining. Redundant with Celebrate Freedom Week

purposes, including establishing justice, ensuring domestic tranquility, providing for the common defense, promoting the general welfare, and securing the blessings of liberty (H, G/Civ);	~~States Constitution including establishing justice, ensuring domestic tranquility, providing for the common defense, promoting the general welfare, and securing the blessings of liberty (H, G/Civ)~~	
7C contrast the relationship between economic freedom and political freedom in communism, socialism, and capitalism using Milton Friedman's Bright Promises, Dismal Performance: An Economist's Protest (G/Civ, E).	7C contrast the relationship between economic freedom and political freedom in communism, socialism, and capitalism ~~using Milton Friedman's Bright Promises, Dismal Performance: An Economist's Protest~~, in terms of property rights protections, living standards, and political rights (G/Civ, E)	Removing the Friedman citation and anchoring the contrast in property rights protections, living standards, and political rights gives students concrete, measurable criteria to compare across the three systems without tying the standard's content to one author's argument or conclusions.
(8A) describe the structure of the legislative branch established in Article I, including bicameralism, membership of the House of Representatives and Senate, leadership, committees, and constitutional voting requirements (G/Civ); (8B) describe the constitutional powers of the legislative branch, including enacting laws, declaring war, levying taxes, appropriating funds, oversight of the executive branch, impeachment, and Senate confirmation of treaties and presidential appointments (G/Civ);	**(8A)** describe the structure of the legislative branch established in Article I, including bicameralism, membership of the House of Representatives and Senate, leadership, and committees (G/Civ); **(8B)** describe the constitutional powers and procedures of the legislative branch, including enacting laws, declaring war, levying taxes, appropriating funds, oversight of the executive branch, impeachment, constitutional voting requirements, and Senate confirmation of treaties and presidential appointments (G/Civ);	Constitutional voting requirements" describes how the legislature acts, not how it's organized, so it was moved from the structure SE (8)(A) into the powers and procedures SE (8)(B), alongside the other procedural items already there.
8E describe the structure of the judicial branch established in Article III, including the Supreme Court and lower federal courts and the appointment, confirmation, and lifetime tenure of federal judges and	(8E) describe the structure of the judicial branch established in Article III, including the Supreme Court and lower federal courts (G/Civ); (8F) describe the constitutional	Appointment, confirmation, and lifetime tenure" describes how judges come to hold office, not the court system's organizational structure, so it was moved from the structure SE (8)(E) into the powers and procedures SE (8)(F), alongside the other procedural items

Supreme Court justices (G/Civ); (8F) describe the constitutional powers of the judicial branch, including resolving cases and controversies, interpreting the Constitution and federal law, and exercising the power of judicial review as established in Marbury v. Madison (H, G/Civ);	powers and procedures of the judicial branch, including resolving cases and controversies, interpreting the Constitution and federal law, exercising the power of judicial review as established in Marbury v. Madison, and the appointment, confirmation, and lifetime tenure of federal judges and Supreme Court justices (H, G/Civ);	already there.
9H explain the purpose of the 17th amendment in establishing direct election of United States Senators and explain how direct election expanded the role of citizens in selecting members of the United States Senate (H, G/Civ);	9H ~~explain the purpose of~~ analyze how the 17th amendment's ~~in establishing~~ establishment of direct election ~~of United States Senators and explain how direct election~~ expanded ~~the~~ citizens' role ~~of citizens~~ in selecting ~~members of the~~ United States ~~Senate~~ Senators (H, G/Civ);	Streamlining and clarity
(13G) explain how the Electoral College balances population influence by giving smaller states a stronger voice in presidential elections than a direct popular vote would provide and explain how electoral vote allocation determined the outcomes of the elections of 1824, 1876, 1888, 2000, and 2016 (H, G/Civ).	~~(13G) explain how the Electoral College balances population influence by giving smaller states a stronger voice in presidential elections than a direct popular vote would provide and explain how electoral vote allocation determined the outcomes of the elections of 1824, 1876, 1888, 2000, and 2016 (H, G/Civ).~~ 13G evaluate arguments for and against the Electoral College, including its effects on representation, small state influence, and democratic participation (H, G/Civ, S). NEW 13H analyze how the electoral college affects presidential elections, including historical elections of 1824, 1876, 1888, 2000, and 2016 (H, G/Civ)	The original standard embeds a favorable conclusion about the Electoral College ("balances population influence") and combines two different tasks into one; the revision splits these into 13G, where students evaluate arguments for and against the system rather than being told its effect, and 13H, which isolates the historical election analysis on its own.

(15) Public Meetings. The student understands decorum expectations and procedures used to conduct meetings of governing bodies. The student is expected to: (A) explain that Robert's Rules Newly Revised is a code of ethics designed to facilitate democratic process and is considered the parliamentary standard for most organizations and governing bodies (G/Civ); (B) explain guiding principles of parliamentary procedure including: the definition of a deliberative assembly, the majority has the right to decide, but the minority has the right to be heard; while the minority disagrees, it must abide by the decision of the majority; debate must be fair to all concerned (G/Civ); (C) explain quorum rules, the steps of a motion, and different voting methods and thresholds in a meeting (G/Civ); (D) explain rules of debate, including both sides must be heard, participants are entitled to only two speeches on a question unless the rules of debate have been modified, the content of a speech must be germane and courteous, and bodies may pass motions to limit or end debate; (E) explain that the Texas Open Meetings Act and similar laws are designed to ensure meetings of governmental bodies happen with transparency, accountability, and fairness (G/Civ); and (F) identify the meeting schedule, recent agenda topics, and meeting minutes of local	(15) Public Meetings. The student understands decorum expectations and procedures used to conduct meetings of governing bodies. The student is expected to: (A) explain that Robert's Rules Newly Revised is a code of ethics designed to facilitate democratic process and is considered the parliamentary standard for most organizations and governing bodies (G/Civ); ~~(B) explain guiding principles of parliamentary procedure including: the definition of a deliberative assembly, the majority has the right to decide, but the minority has the right to be heard; while the minority disagrees, it must abide by the decision of the majority; debate must be fair to all concerned (G/Civ);~~ ~~(C) explain quorum rules, the steps of a motion, and different voting methods and thresholds in a meeting (G/Civ);~~ ~~(D) explain rules of debate, including both sides must be heard, participants are entitled to only two speeches on a question unless the rules of debate have been modified, the content of a speech must be germane and courteous, and bodies may pass motions to limit or end debate;~~ ~~(E) explain that the Texas Open Meetings Act and similar laws are designed to ensure meetings of governmental bodies happen with transparency, accountability, and fairness (G/Civ); and~~	Streamline to only include what is required of TEC 28.002

governmental bodies, including, where appropriate, the county commissioners court, the city, and the school board (G/Civ).	~~(F) identify the meeting schedule, recent agenda topics, and meeting minutes of local governmental bodies, including, where appropriate, the county commissioners court, the city, and the school board (G/Civ).~~	
	(16 NEW) Modern Campaigns, Elections, Media, Political Parties and Participation. The student understands the role of modern campaigns, elections, media, political parties and participation in United States Government. The student is expected to: (A) explain the roles and responsibilities of citizens in United States elections (G/Civ); (B) compare the two-party system and the role of third parties in the United States using historical data, maps, charts, or graphs to synthesize evidence and draw conclusions (H, G/Civ, Geo/C, S); (C) explain how representative districts are crafted, including use of the census and the process of reapportionment using demographic patterns (G/Civ, Geo/C, S); and (D) analyze the voting process and election laws in Texas using simulations of democratic processes, including voting, due process, and caucuses (H, G/Civ, S). **(E)** analyze the role of campaign finance in modern elections, including individual contributions, political action committees, and	Aligns to TEC 28.002 and will help students be informed voters

	disclosure requirements, and the constitutional protections established in Citizens United v. FEC (G/Civ, E); **(F)** describe the role of media in American elections, including traditional media, social media, and political advertising, and explain their effects on public opinion and voter behavior (G/Civ); **(G)** evaluate the role and limitations of public opinion polling in campaigns and elections (G/Civ, S); H) describe the factors that influence an individual's political attitudes and actions, including the influence of family, community, media, and personal experience.	

Personal Financial Literacy

The current standards, as written, require significantly more instructional time than a single semester course can realistically provide. Covering every listed topic in the depth the standards imply would mean either rushing through content or sacrificing the course's signature projects and applied learning experiences, the components that give students hands-on practice with the skills the course is meant to build. Building on the recommendations in the Content Advisors' consensus document, and after reviewing public comments on the proposed standards, streamlining the content addresses this mismatch directly. By narrowing the standards to the core financial literacy skills students most need, budgeting, credit, saving and investing, and consumer decision-making, the course preserves its foundational learning goals and keeps its signature projects intact, while fitting within the time actually available for instruction. This ensures teachers can teach the material thoroughly rather than superficially, and students leave the course with genuine command of the skills it's designed to build, rather than a rushed survey of more content than a semester allows.

Current Language	Proposed Amendment	Rationale
1) Fundamental Concepts of Economics Related to PFL. The student understands fundamental concepts of economics related to	1)Fundamental Concepts of Economics Related to ~~PFL~~ Personal Financial Literacy. The student understands fundamental concepts of	Spell out acronym

personal financial literacy and the role of ethical decision-making and personal responsibility in financial choices. The student is expected to:	economics related to personal financial literacy and the role of ethical decision-making and personal responsibility in financial choices. The student is expected to:	
1A define the economic concepts of scarcity, supply, demand, opportunity cost, free enterprise, profit incentive, appreciation, depreciation, financial integrity, and accountability (G/Civ, E);	~~1A define the economic concepts of scarcity, supply, demand, opportunity cost, free enterprise, profit incentive, appreciation, depreciation, financial integrity, and accountability (G/Civ, E);~~	Standalone vocabulary standards teach terminology separately from the applied skill that requires it, doubling instructional time on the same content. Folding vocabulary into its related applied standard keeps every term while removing ten redundant standards.
1B understand how scarcity drives market prices by applying supply and demand models (E, S);	1B ~~understand~~ explain how scarcity drives market prices by applying supply and demand models (E, ~~S~~);	More measurable verb; no disciplinary thinking skill aligned
4G examine how generational family financial behaviors influence money patterns, goals, personal responsibility, and decision-making (Geo/C, E, S).	~~4G examine how generational family financial behaviors influence money patterns, goals, personal responsibility, and decision-making (Geo/C, E, S).~~	Streamlining
5E evaluate the return on investment of postsecondary education, training, or credentialing pathways, including total cost, earning potential, time commitment, and opportunity costs (E, S);	~~5E evaluate the return on investment of postsecondary education, training, or credentialing pathways, including total cost, earning potential, time commitment, and opportunity costs (E, S);~~	Streamlining. Similar to 3F.
5F analyze postsecondary financing options, including scholarships, grants, work-study programs, and student loans (E, S);	~~5F analyze postsecondary financing options, including scholarships, grants, work-study programs, and student loans (E, S);~~	Streamlining. Similar to 3G.
5G explain the purpose of financial aid applications, such as the FAFSA or TASFA, and identify factors that may affect eligibility for federal, state, institutional, and private	~~5G explain the purpose of financial aid applications, such as the FAFSA or TASFA, and identify factors that may affect eligibility for federal, state, institutional,~~	Streamlining. Similar to 3G.

financial aid (G/Civ, E, S);	~~and private financial aid (G/Civ, E, S);~~	
5H assess the financial trade-offs of contract employment, independent contracting, and freelance work, including income variability, taxes, insurance, and benefits (E, S);	~~5H assess the financial trade-offs of contract employment, independent contracting, and freelance work, including income variability, taxes, insurance, and benefits (E, S);~~	Streamlining.
(6C) design a system for tracking income, expenses, and financial records to support accountability and careful oversight (E, S);	~~(6C) design a system for tracking income, expenses, and financial records to support accountability and careful oversight (E, S);~~	Streamlining.
(6D) model a purposeful giving plan, including 10-10-80, that considers time, talents, and monetary donations while evaluating budget impact, recordkeeping, and potential tax benefits (G/Civ, E, S);	~~(6D) model a purposeful giving plan, including 10-10-80, that considers time, talents, and monetary donations while evaluating budget impact, recordkeeping, and potential tax benefits (G/Civ, E, S);~~	Streamlining
7J appraise responsible use of financial technology through automated investment platforms, including robot-advisors and micro-investing apps, by analyzing fee structures, investment strategies, algorithmic limitations, and suitability for different investor profiles (E, S);	~~7J appraise responsible use of financial technology through automated investment platforms, including robot-advisors and micro-investing apps, by analyzing fee structures, investment strategies, algorithmic limitations, and suitability for different investor profiles (E, S);~~	Streamlining
7K distinguish how automatic enrollment and opt-in versus opt-out retirement and savings plan designs affect participation rates and long-term wealth building (E, S); and	~~7K distinguish how automatic enrollment and opt-in versus opt-out retirement and savings plan designs affect participation rates and long-term wealth building (E, S); and~~	Streamlining
7L create an investment plan using stocks, bonds, mutual funds, or other types of financial instruments that builds a diversified portfolio that has a reporting period of two to four weeks (E).	7L create an investment plan using stocks, bonds, mutual funds, or other types of financial instruments that builds a diversified portfolio~~ that has a reporting period of two to four~~	Streamlining

	~~weeks~~ (E).	
8D develop a plan to build or maintain creditworthiness (E, S);	~~8D develop a plan to build or maintain creditworthiness (E, S);~~	Streamlining. Similar to 8C. Reads as a classroom activity rather than a standard defining what students should know or analyze.
8F analyze the components of the cost of borrowing, including annual percentage rate, fixed versus variable interest rates, length of term, grace period, and additional fees (E, S);	~~8F analyze the components of the cost of borrowing, including annual percentage rate, fixed versus variable interest rates, length of term, grace period, and additional fees (E, S);~~	Streamlining. Similar to 7E.
10E examine how entrepreneurs respond to supply-and-demand trends and unmet needs in the marketplace through innovation, problem solving, and responsible service to consumers (E, S);	~~10E examine how entrepreneurs respond to supply-and-demand trends and unmet needs in the marketplace through innovation, problem solving, and responsible service to consumers (E, S);~~	Streamlining. Similar to 10F.